

# c11-Paper ICCIE2012- WS\_Suherman

*by* Wawan S. Sundawan

---

**Submission date:** 29-Dec-2019 07:52PM (UTC+0700)

**Submission ID:** 1238642012

**File name:** c11-Paper\_ICCIE2012-WS\_Suherman.pdf (247.71K)

**Word count:** 3851

**Character count:** 23325

## 4 Paradigm and Policy on Kindergarten Education: Multicase Study of Three Types of Kindergarten\*)

By

8 Wawan S. Suherman  
Faculty of Sport Science, Yogyakarta State University  
[ws\\_suherman@yahoo.com](mailto:ws_suherman@yahoo.com), [wansuherman@uny.ac.id](mailto:wansuherman@uny.ac.id)

### 3 Abstract

This study was aimed to determine: (1) the paradigm of kindergarten education implemented in managing kindergarten education; (2) the policy of Sleman District Government utilized and implemented by the management of kindergarten; (3) the management of kindergarten education practiced by kindergartens; and (4) the linkages among paradigms, and policies of kindergarten education with the management of kindergarten education.

This research used the multicase approach. The cases under study were: kindergarten educational paradigms and theories, kindergarten education policy issued by the Sleman District Government, Kindergarten (TK) Ceria, Demangan Baru; TK Model Sleman; and TK IT Husnayain Tempel. The data were collected through participant observation, in-depth interviews, focus group discussions, the instrument distributed to the principals, and qualitative content analysis of documents. The validity and reliability of the data were maintained through the implementation of the protocol of the study, the use of the trustworthiness of the people who collected and analyzed the data, to multiply the flow of information sources, and perform data triangulation. The data were analyzed using a multi-phased deductive coding approach.

The results of the study show that (1) TK Ceria utilizes the Paradigm of Human Rights; TK Model utilizes the Paradigm of "Economy and Politics"; and TK IT harness the Paradigm of "Social and Culture"; (2) Educational policies of Sleman District Government are utilized as a foundation in the implementation of educational services and have some variations in the policy implementation level in the three types of kindergartens; (4) the policies, paradigms of education, and management of kindergarten education are interrelated and mutually influential when analyzed using (a) the theory of preschool cultural shift by Tobin, Wu, and Davidson (1989), and (b) the theory of early childhood education paradigm shift by Woodhead (2006).

**Keywords:** *type of kindergarten, educational policy, educational paradigm, and management of kindergarten education*

### Introduction

Globalization leads great effect around worldwide life, including Indonesia. Consequently, government and people of Indonesia must do any efforts to participate actively and accomodate the rapid changes. Zamroni (2007: 175-178) states that globalization would take effects on education, in three aspects. Firstly, great increase on commercializing and comoditizing of education. Secondly, internationalizing of education that result in homogenized education. Thirdly, requirement on competing tools and wellbeing efforts in global era, such like *virtual skills, intellectual capital, social capital, dan moral capital*.

One of affecting sector in this global era is education. Therefore, education is expected to resolve the negative effects of globalization and elevate the positif sides. Kindergarten as the very early education takes essential role on it. On this period, children get exposure on education culture on formal education sector. Nevertheless, in practice, education on this early phase emphasizes on the reading – writing - math skills, instead of learning culture. Due to demand on these academic skills, the main goal of early education is being

abandoned. This fact causes an inconsistency on paradigm and praxice of early education.

Instead of this challenge, Sleman district government formulates policy on kindergarten education, to empower the improvement of education on this phase. As one of region in Special Province of Jogjakarta, geographically and demographically, it becomes the main buffer of this province. On RKPD (Pemkab Sleman, 2008: 8), Sleman district government divides the development areas into: (1) aglomerasion areas – city development on certain areas, (2) sub-urban areas – border areas of city-village, and (3) buffer zone – areas purposed for certain functions.

Besides its strategic location and accessibility, Sleman district comprise rapid settlement development. This results in the increasing of kindergarten as one of education need in this area. Data on Renstra Dinas Dikpora 2011-2015 indicates that there are 4 public kindergartens, and 515 private kindergartens in Sleman. Instead of that number, the kindergartens have not accommodated all kids of that age all over Sleman district. Meanwhile, The RKPD (Pemkab Sleman, 2008: 43) has laid priority on the improvement of the quality and quantity of early childhood education since 2009, as well as easing the access of early

education. This priority is sustained due to facts that the numbers of under-six children that are not accommodated in kindergartens or pre-schools are ample (Renstra Dinas Dikpora 2011 – 2015). Besides, Bappenas (2008) stated that national raw participation number of kindergarten indicated 40%. This number is considered low compared to the raw participation number of upper education.

The Government of Indonesia stated Permendiknas number 58 year of 2009 as a standardized guidance for the kindergartens administrator to run its education. These standards cover: (1) achievement growth standard, (2) educators and education staff standard, (3) content, process, and evaluation standard, as well (4) facility, management, and funding standard.

Kindergarten education is also an educational praxice. Therefore, the kindergarten education praxice must be based on education paradigm. Woodhead (2006) states that early education paradigm consist of (1) growth paradigm, (2) economic and political paradigm, (3) social and culture paradigm, (4) human right paradigm. Moreover, there is also among siswa paradigm promoted by Ki Hadjar Dewantara (2009), founding father of Tamansiswa. Besides founded on education paradigm, education in kindergarten needs to be supported by adequate policy. Riant Nugroho (2011) states that educational policy considered adequate if it has formal form, clear base, comprehensive direction, and complete substance, that applicable for the stake holders.

Based on those discussions, the management of kindergarten, kindergarten educational paradigm, and kindergarten educational policy issued by government of Sleman district need to be studied and researched. The study should focus on the correlation of the management of kindergarten with the policy issued by government of Sleman district as well as the kindergarten educational paradigm implemented.

### Research Method

This research applies multicase approach (Yin, 2009). The reasearch case are policies, paradigms of education, and management of kindergarten education in TK Ceria Demangan Baru, TK Model Sleman, and TK IT Husnayain Tempel. The data were collected through participatory observation, in-depth interviews, focus group discussions, spread instrument to the principals, and qualitative document content analysis (Audifax, 2008; Denzin & Lincoln, 2009; Merriam, 2009). The validity and reliability of the data were maintained through the implementation of the protocol of the study, the use of people trustworthiness of those who collect and analyze data, multiply the flow of information sources, and performance of data triangulation DellaMatera, 2006; Denzin & Lincoln, 2009; Yin, 2009). The data were analyzed using a multi-phased

deductive coding approach (Burhan Bungin, 2003; Merriam, 2009).

## Research Result and Discussion

### 1. Kindergarten Education Paradigm

Observation on the educational process, teacher and administrator interviews, and document analysis on those three types of kindergarten indicates that the three paradigms are applied as the basis of educational process on those schools. Kindergarten Ceria utilizes human right paradigm in organizing the education to take the children to be a smart, cheerful, bright human.

As a public school, Kindergarten Model possesses specific features. This school has got ample facilities and competent teachers. It utilizes "Economy and Politic Paradigm" which is implied on its mission to encourage students' potential, promote academic achievement, and support the government policy.

Husnayain Islamic Kindergarten employs "Human School" perspective as the implementation of the mission to build capable scientist moslem. For this reason, this school benefit "Social and Culture paradigm" as the basis of the education organization.

Out of five paradigms, three paradigms applied by three different kindergartens. While the other two paradigms, Growth paradigm and "Among Siswa" paradigm were not taken into account. Growth paradigm was not applied because it has been internalized into Economy and Politic Paradigm and Socio-Cultural Paradigm. While "Among Siswa" Paradigm, which is the typical feature of Tamansiswa, was not recognized on those three schools because they do not belong to Tamansiswa School.

### 2. Utilized Educational Policy

Government of Sleman district issued three types of policies, namely (1) macro-policy, (2) mесо-policy, dan (3) micro-policy. Due to continental system applied, macro-policy would be more effective if completed by mесо-policy and micro-policy as the technical guide of the implementation. Kindergarten Education Policy issued by government of Sleman district is clearly oriented and comprehensible by education administrators. Additionally, the orientation of Kindergarten education policy is stated in *Renstra Dinas Dikpora Sleman 2011 – 2015*.

Substancially, kindergarten education policy of government of Sleman district rules the authority of kindergarten management which then disposed to the district office of education, youth and sport affairs. The office then issued an educational policy to rule the organization of kindergarten education, covering (1) planning and development of kindergarten education, (2)

curriculum and students affair, (3) educators and education staff maintenance, and (4) facility management.

Ceria Kindergarten and Husnayain Islamic Kindergarten utilize notary deed in organizing its education. Ceria kindergarten is proposing its lisencc while Husnayain is holding its lisencc through Decree of Kepala Dinas Pendidikan number 056/KPTS.PEND. SLEMAN/IV/2004. Husnayain has got its credit certificate from the district office of education, youth and sport affairs, certificate number 009/Pend.Sleman/IV/2004 grading for B. Model kindergarten conduct its educational service based on local government decree number 185/Kep.KDH/A/2008. The three kindergartens have applied the government of Sleman district policy according to their conditions.

The implementation of educational policy on those kindergartens are varied, depending on school capability. Ceria kindergarten is proposing for its foundation and operational lisencc. On the other hand, administrator of Model kindergarten is trying to apply all policy issued by goverment of Sleman district. Husnayain Islamic kindergarten has got its credit certificate and try to apply all goverment of Sleman district as well.

The implementation of kindergarten policy is monitored by district office of education, youth, and sport affairs through school supervising conducted by early childhood education and elementary school supervisor in every district. Kindergartens and primary school are superintended under the same supervisor based on organization structure of district office of education, youth and sport affairs. This results in less focus supervising, one field might be neglected.

In central level, kindergarten affair is standing under the directorate of early childhood education, in contrast, at the district government level, kindergarten stand under the same division as primary schools. Consequently, the superintendent and supervising process is less focus. In many cases, school superintendents pay more focus on one level while the other education level is less supervised. The inconsistency of division level create problem in coordination as well.

Cooper, Fusarelli, and Randall (2004: 43 - 45) state that effort to comprehend educational policies might be conducted by analizing their dimensions, namely normative, structural, constituent, and technical dimensions. Those dimensions are developed based on system theory, neo-pluralis advocate alliance and group mission theory, neo-institutional theory,

critical theory, feminism theory, postmo, and ideology perspective.

However, the process and evaluation of government of Sleman district are not the highlight of this research. Evaluation on educational policies issued by Sleman government is conducted by district office of education, youth, and sport affairs and its staff. For instance kindergarten and primary school superintendent would evaluate the school performance which are under his or her supervision.

### **3. Kindergarten Organization**

Education management is an act of organizing students, teachers and staffs, curriculum, learning process, facilities, funding, and management (A. Martuti, 2009; Jasa Unggul Muliawan, 2009; Dit. TK-SD, 2010; Dit. PAUD, 2011). The three kindergartens laying its education services on the basis of education paradigm they belief, in accordance with the policies issued by government of Sleman district and school conditions.

The three kindergartens have ideal number of students whose progress are monitored regularly and continuously. Their progress are then reported and given treatment as part of service. Moreover, the students of those schools are looked after by competent teachers and teacher assistants who have mostly got teacher education background. The principals, as well, have been certified and fulfilled formal requirements, except the principal of Ceria kindergarten. The administration staffs in those schools are available, except in Husnayain.

The curriculum in each kindergarten has its own feature. The kindergartens apply national curriculum (2004 National Curriculum) and combine it with local content subject according school vision-mission and philosophy (paradigm and learning theory) they belief. Ceria kindergarten integrates the curriculum with the building of eleven aspects of children potentials. Model kindergarten combines the curriculum with international standardized subjects. While Husnayain kindergarten integrates the curriculum into the principles of moslem characters.

The process of setting routine and developing basic skill in those schools are influenced by school vision and educational goals. Besides, it is also colored BCCT promoted by the district office of education, youth, and sport affairs policy, though facilities and resources of the schools differ the implementation.

The management of facilities of the kindergartens is varied though all are oriented to support the learning process. The most ideal



facilities support present at Model kindergarten while the least is at Husnayain kindergarten. Ceria kindergarten facilities are in between, not that ideal but sufficient.

For the school fee, Model kindergarten has got government support but still the school requires the parent school fare. On the other hand, Ceria and Husnayain kindergarten, which are private school, depend their funding fully on parents support. The parents of these schools do not have any objection on the expensive fare because they believe that it equals to the service.

To support the service and learning process, the administrator of those schools set a settle organization structure, make long and short term plan, conduct fair and transparent internal management, such like planning school funding budget with the school committee

#### **4. Correlation among educational paradigm, educational policy, and kindergarten management.**

The correlation analysis of educational paradigm, and policy with the kindergarten organization apply two approaches, namely (1) the theory of preschool cultural shift by Tobin, Wu, and Davidson (1989), and (2) the theory of early childhood education paradigm shift by Woodhead (2006).

##### **a. The theory of preschool cultural shift by Tobin, Wu, and Davidson (1989)**

Tobin, Wu, and Davidson justify that there is specific shift on the pre-school service, such like improvement on language skill in different ways in different country, emphasis on academic skills in some countries, and shift on learning approach for children due to cultural shift in China and USA.

Tobin, Wu, and Davidson's study in line with the conditions of the studied kindergartens. The education organization conducted is influenced by people demand shift as well as teacher' and administrator paradigm shift. Sleman residents are facing shift of family role that result in shift of nursery need. The nursery is shifting from mother to formal school due to raise of working mother either in village or in city. This need, then, responded by private institution by providing schools.

Besides demanding improvement on education service, people expect kindergarten education which provides students with religious knowledge and practice. This perspective shift cause education paradigm changes the implementation of education organization. But, still, the literacy skill (reading-writing-aritmathical skill) has become the most

expected skill, though it's not in line with the function of kindergarten. This fact requires the kindergarten to meet the paradigm and the demand.

Husnayain kindergarten was founded in its district now due to demand of education for working mothers' kids. Ceria kindergarten move its location to Demangan Baru by considering its prospective parents. Meanwhile, Model kindergarten gives its service both for governement policy and people demand.

Government policy and its change have been very influencing on the development of kindergarten education. Some of the policies, which are changing due to quality education, are: foundation and operational requirement, credit evaluation of school management, and kindergarten teacher certification. The policy demand the kindergarten to improve its educational services.

##### **b. The theory of early childhood education paradigm shift by Woodhead (2006).**

Woodhead (2006) stated that both policy and practice of early education are shaped by scheme and discourse of childhood. Nowadays, the improvement of children education quality has been international and national concern. Many countries do ample efforts to improve their early education by promoting discussion and research on early chidren educational paradigm and theory.

Through the researches and studies, Woodhead (2006: 5 – 6) concludes that they are very affecting to develop early education policy and practice. Historically, education paradigm, and its controversy, is related to economical, educational, and social changes of minority class. In the past education paradigm tended to be dominated by the rich which then emerged new educational paradigm, namely human right educational paradigm which is based on social justice.

Woodhead analysis stated that educational practice is affected by government policy. This statement was in accordance with the result of interview with teachers, principals, and supervisors of the obeserved kindergartens. They stated that one of the most influencing factor on their education organization is government policy. Furthermore, the policy can affect the kindergartens either positively or negatively. Sleman Government, in this case, shows effort to improve its pre-school quality through its policy. This goal is in line with Cooper, Fusarelli, and Randall

(2004: 161) who state that educational policies are issued to improve education quality. The improvement is, then, performed by providing better program and staffs, settled curriculum and standard, higher test result and graduation number.

Both public and private kindergartens follow the government policy, particularly on liscence, credit point, and teacher certification. As a result, the government policy indicates positive affects on those schools. Moreover, the effectiveness of government policy implementation depends strongly on surperintendent role, which help the schools interaction with the education dapartment. In practice the superintendant role as a bridge is very helpful for private schools.

Cooper, Fusarelli, and Randall (2004: 148) remind that issued education policy would be solving policy when it applies participatory approach. Policy should accomodate related practisioners and stakeholders need by taking their proposals into account. This pattern is not only performed by involving those parties (government official, parents, and students but also by democratizing the education policy making process. Fowler (2009) stated that the success of educational policy implementation in the school level would be determined by school leadership, in this term is principal leadership.

Teachers and administrator of kindergartens organize the educational service on the basis of paradigm they believe. It is supported by Morrison's idea (1988: 465) that teachers should develop teaching paradigm as their guideline in conducting the instruction. The paradigm would help the teacher to be more well organized and well oriented, while explore students potential better.

At the three kindergartens, paradigm, policy, and organization are interrelated and influencing each other. The applied educational paradigm are affected and facilitated by government policy. In addition, the kindergarten organization is performed on the basis of paradigm and educational policy issued by Sleman government.

## Conclusion

To answer the research problems based on data description, data analysis, and the discussion, the conclusion of this research are:

1. Ceria kindergarten utilizes human right paradigm, Model kindergarten applies economy and politic paradigm, while Husnayain Islamic

kindergarten use socio-culture paradigm on the management of education.

2. Ceria and Husnayain kindergarten were established on notary deed, which then proposed its foundation and operational liscence at Dinas Dikpora Sleman. Model kindergarten, located in Blotan Ngemplak Sleman, was established based on Decree of Bupati Sleman number 185/Kep.KDH/A/2008. Furthermore, the kindergartens apply educational policy as the basis of their organization. They implement the policies by their capacities which are supervised by a superintendant or supervisor.
3. To meet the goal, the kindergartens attempt to meet the management, related to students, teachers and staffs, curriculum, learning process, facilities, funding, and administration, with the issued policy.
4. Internal and external factor are very influencing on the organization of the kindergartens. Internal factor are covering all strength and weakness of the kindergartens, while external factor are threats and opportunities from the environment.
5. The correlation among kindergarten educational policy, educational paradigm, and the management of kindergartens are analyzed using (1) the theory of preschool cultural shift by Tobin, Wu, and Davidson (1989), and (2) the theory of early childhood education paradigm shift by Woodhead (2006). The first theory indicates that Sleman district government educational policy and cultural change of the society are affecting to kindergarten educational paradigm, and management of kindergarten education. The second theory shows that the kindergarten education policy issued by Sleman district government, educational paradigm, and the management of kindergarten applied by the school stakeholders are interrelated and mutually influencing.

\*) This article is an integral part of Wawan S. Suherman's Dissertation on title: Paradigm and policy on kindergarten education: Multicase study of three types of kindergartens.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I would like to express my gratitude to my promoters (Prof. Suyata, Ph.D. and Prof. Dr. Endang Ekowarni), and all of parties who have supported and advised me in doing this research.

## REFERENCES

- 15 Audifax. (2008). *Re-search: Sebuah pengantar untuk "mencari ulang" metode penelitian dalam Psikologi*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.

- 5 Bappenas RI. (2008). Peraturan Presiden nomor 38 Tahun 2008 tentang Rencana kerja pemerintah Tahun 2009. Diunduh 14 Desember 2008, dari: <http://www.bappenas.go.id/index.php/module/Perpres38RKP2009/>
- 6 Burhan Bungin. (2003). *Analisis data penelitian kualitatif*. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
- 7 Cooper, B.S., Fusarelli, L.D., & Randall, E.V. (2004). *Better policies, better schools: Theories and applications*. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
- 5 DellaMattera, J.N.M. (2006). "A historical comparative analysis Of Preschool policy frameworks". *Dissertation*. The University of Maine.
- 6 Denzin, N.K., & Lincoln, Y.S. (Eds.). (2009). *Handbook of qualitative research*. (Terjemahan Dariyatno, dkk). Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Dinas Dikpora Sleman. (2010). *Keputusan Kepala Dinas Dikpora Sleman nomor 402/KPTS/2010 Tentang Rencana Strategis Dinas Pendidikan, Pemuda dan Olahraga Tahun 2011 – 2015*.
- 18 Direktorat Pembinaan TK dan SD. (2010). *Pengelolaan Taman Kanak-kanak*. Jakarta: Dit Pembinaan TK-SD, Ditjen Mandikdasmen, Kemdiknas.
- 22 Direktorat Pembinaan PAUD. (2011). *Petunjuk teknis penyelenggaraan taman kanak-kanak*. Jakarta: Dit Bin PAUD, Ditjen PAUDNI, Kemdiknas.
- 14 Fowler, Frances C. (2009). *Policy studies for educational leaders: An introduction*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Kemdiknas. (2009). *Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Nomor 58 Tahun 2009 Tentang Standar PAUD*.
- Ki Hadjar Dewantara. (2009). *Memuju manusia merdeka*. Yogyakarta: Leutika.
- 13 Merriam, Sharan B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- 17 Morrison, George S., (1988). *Early childhood education today*. 4<sup>th</sup> ed. Columbus: Merrill Publishing Company.
- 21 Pemkab Sleman. (2008). *Rencana kerja pemerintah daerah (RKPD) kabupaten Sleman tahun 2009*. Diunduh 15 Mei 2010 dari: [http://bappeda.slemankab.go.id/index.php?option=com\\_remository&Itemid=35&func=selectcat&cat=12&lang=english](http://bappeda.slemankab.go.id/index.php?option=com_remository&Itemid=35&func=selectcat&cat=12&lang=english).
- 12 . (2008). *Keputusan Bupati Sleman Nomor 185/ Kep.KDH/A/ 2008 tentang Pendirian Taman Kanak-kanak dan Sekolah Dasar Model Kabupaten Sleman*.
- Riant Nugroho. (2011). *Public policy: Dinamika kebijakan – analisis kebijakan – manajemen kebijakan*. Edisi ke-3. Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo.
- 1 Tobin, J.J., Wu, D.Y.H., & Davidson, D.H. (1989). *Preschool in three cultures: Japan, China, and the United States*. New Heaven: Yale University Press.
- 2 Woodhead, Martin. (2006). "Changing perspectives on early childhood: Theory, research and policy." *Background paper prepared for the education for all global monitoring report 2007 Strong foundations: early childhood care and education*. UNESCO. Diunduh 24 Mei 2010, dari: <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001474/147499e.pdf>.
- 11 Yin, Robert K. (2009). *Studi kasus: Desain dan metode*. (terjemahan M. Djauzi Mudzakir). Jakarta: PT. RajaGrafindo Persada.
- 16 Zamroni. (2007). *Pendidikan dan demokrasi dalam transisi (Prakondisi menuju era globalisasi)*. Jakarta: PSAP Muhammadiyah.

# c11-Paper ICCIE2012-WS\_Suherman

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

11%

SIMILARITY INDEX

11%

INTERNET SOURCES

6%

PUBLICATIONS

7%

STUDENT PAPERS

## PRIMARY SOURCES

1

[hdl.handle.net](http://hdl.handle.net)

Internet Source

1%

2

[www.csse-scee.ca](http://www.csse-scee.ca)

Internet Source

1%

3

[repository.unimal.ac.id](http://repository.unimal.ac.id)

Internet Source

1%

4

[docplayer.net](http://docplayer.net)

Internet Source

1%

5

[vdocuments.site](http://vdocuments.site)

Internet Source

1%

6

[repository.unair.ac.id](http://repository.unair.ac.id)

Internet Source

1%

7

Submitted to Pembroke Pines Charter High School

Student Paper

1%

8

[101.203.168.85](http://101.203.168.85)

Internet Source

1%

9

[www.reproductive-health-journal.com](http://www.reproductive-health-journal.com)



10

[www.tksdmodelsleman.sch.id](http://www.tksdmodelsleman.sch.id)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

11

[issuu.com](http://issuu.com)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

12

Submitted to Catholic University of  
Parahyangan

Student Paper

&lt;1 %

13

[staff.uny.ac.id](http://staff.uny.ac.id)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

14

[docobook.com](http://docobook.com)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

15

[ejournal.unida.gontor.ac.id](http://ejournal.unida.gontor.ac.id)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

16

[studylib.net](http://studylib.net)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

17

[www.scribd.com](http://www.scribd.com)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

18

[edoc.pub](http://edoc.pub)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

19

Christine Pascal, Tony Bertram. "Listening to  
young citizens: the struggle to make real a  
participatory paradigm in research with young

&lt;1 %

# children", European Early Childhood Education Research Journal, 2009

Publication

20	<a href="http://globalactionweek.org">globalactionweek.org</a> Internet Source	<1 %
21	<a href="http://journal.uii.ac.id">journal.uii.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
22	<a href="http://pt.scribd.com">pt.scribd.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
23	<a href="http://cimahikota.go.id">cimahikota.go.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
24	Submitted to St. Mary's College Twickenham Student Paper	<1 %
25	<a href="http://cogoogle.com.sg">cogoogle.com.sg</a> Internet Source	<1 %
26	<a href="http://indigenoupsych.org">indigenoupsych.org</a> Internet Source	<1 %

Exclude quotes Off  
Exclude bibliography Off

Exclude matches Off

# c11-Paper ICCIE2012-WS\_Suherman

## GRADEMARK REPORT

FINAL GRADE

/100

GENERAL COMMENTS

Instructor

PAGE 1

PAGE 2

PAGE 3

PAGE 4

PAGE 5

PAGE 6